

# New Strategies to Peace in Israel-Palestine: Safe Zones Inside Israel and a Three State Solution: A Working Paper

By Steven Balkin, Professor Emeritus, Roosevelt University, Email: [sbalkin@roosevelt.edu](mailto:sbalkin@roosevelt.edu) January 19, 2024

--- As thinking human beings, we must reject the binary. We must feel the pain of both Jewish and Palestinian Israelis and the pain of those in Gaza and the West Bank. We can hold the pain of all who are suffering, and we must hold it all. - Rabbi Sharon Kleinbaum in a letter to her congregation, <https://cbst.org/latest/letter22nov/>

## Background<sup>1</sup>

What Hamas did on October 7 was immoral and suicidal for themselves and for the Palestinian population that they are supposed to provide governmental leadership for. Hamas seeks to push Israelis to leave their land for a more hospitable less dangerous place.<sup>2</sup> Hamas is hoping and expecting Jews to abandon Israel to avoid the danger of Hamas violence.

The current Netanyahu government of Israel has a similar vision: to make life so unbearable for Palestinians that they will immigrate. It's sometimes called "Silent Transfer". Palestinians express this as: "They want the land - any way they can get it."

The political leader of Hamas in Gaza, Yayha Sinwar, is believed to be the mastermind of the Oct. 7 massacre.<sup>3</sup> Even though he has a history of violence directed against Palestinians as well as Israelis, he used deceptive rhetoric and communications about wanting peace with the Israel to lull them into a trap, where the Netanyahu government let down their guard and ignored Israeli intelligence reports that a major Hamas attack was on the horizon.

Many Palestinians respect and admire Sinwar, while others view him as a violent sociopath.<sup>4</sup> Gazan civilians who took some active role in the Oct. 7 massacre may have been very reluctant to do so and their preference may have been for peaceful co-existence with Israel. They may have been reluctantly pressed into collaboration with Hamas. They cannot move with their feet. There is no functioning Bill of Rights in Gaza. Hamas can execute a person for suspected sympathy towards Israel. Hamas has lured Israel into a trap to kill thousands of civilian Gazans as collateral damage.<sup>5</sup> The advantage to Hamas is that it demonstrates that (1) Palestinians need Hamas to protect them; (2) this is a way to generate new recruits to Hamas; (3) Israel is disproportionately harsh towards the Palestinians, resulting in street demonstrations against Israel all over the world; (4) it is more difficult for military maneuvers and intelligence gathering to find and eliminate Hamas and (5) it is an effective way to demoralize the soldiers in the IDF.

Regardless of the guilt of Palestinian civilians towards killing and capturing Israelis and the guilt of the Netanyahu government and Israel Defense Forces (IDF) towards inflicting casualties on Palestinian civilians, they are all caught in a trap of war that needs a way out. I am suggesting a way to walk out of that trap: for Israel to flip the script. Even though Hamas repeatedly calls for a ceasefire, it is in Sinwar's strategic interest to keep the war going. Palestinians are unable to generate street protests against Hamas. Those who do invite assassination. Israel has the incentive, the power, and the sechel (Yiddish for common sense) to turn things around in its favor.

I am suggesting two ways out of this trap, a short term approach by Israel creating new safe zones for

Gazan civilians inside Israel and a longer term approach, a three state solution.

On November 8, 2023, U.S. Secretary of State Antony Blinken said: "We believe that the time is now to start the conversation about the future – not tomorrow, not after the war, today – because identifying the longer-term objectives and a pathway to get there will help shape our approach to addressing immediate needs."<sup>6</sup> I concur and hope these two strategies below move the Middle East to that objective.

## **Short Term Strategy for Peace in Israel-Palestine**

Egypt won't let Gazan civilians live temporarily in the Sinai Peninsula to get out of harm's way,, under the assumption that either Israel won't let them back in Gaza, or that they may refuse to move back in Gaza under an oppressive Hamas or Netanyahu Coalition government, or that Hamas members will infiltrate into the Palestinian civilian population and cause civil discord for Egypt as did the Muslim Brotherhood. Another name for Hamas is the Palestinian Muslim Brotherhood. It is an outgrowth from the Egyptian version founded in 1928 by schoolteacher Hassan al-Banna, initially to promote personal development and social reform. However, it soon became politicized and later transformed into a militant and militaristic movement. Under the leadership of Mohamed Morsi, it was elected into power in Egypt in 2012 and then deposed in a coup a year later by Field Marshal Abdel Fattah El-Sisi.

UN Aid workers in Gaza and civilian Gazans themselves want to be in a safe place of refuge away from the violent conflict between Hamas and the IDF. But there is no place that will accept them. At the urging of Israel, a large number of Gazan civilians have already left Northern Gaza for Southern Gaza. The headline for an article about this in the NY Times reads, "With Combat in the South, Gazans Must Flee Again. But Where?"<sup>7</sup> On December 8, 2023 UN Secretary General Antonio Guterres remarked to the UN Security Council, "The people of Gaza are being told to move like human pinballs—ricocheting between ever-smaller slivers of the south, without any of the basics for survival," ... "Nowhere in Gaza is safe."<sup>8</sup>

Transforming events in wars of attrition which have no good outcomes, often involves trying to change what is leading to the unacceptable choices. In this case it is the lack of enough safe place for civilian refuge. Israel should provide a place of refuge for Gazan civilians.

Israel should create a fenced and walled temporary humanitarian residential zone inside Israel contiguous to the eastern border of Gaza that is 5 miles (8 kilometers) wide as a temporary way station for Gazan Palestinians to live while the clean-up operations against Hamas are carried on in Gaza. The area is to be policed by the IDF in cooperation with friendly Arab neighbors. This area is largely devoid of Israelis since October 7.

This safe zone is for Gazans with no militaristic or personal positive affiliation to Hamas. There are experienced screener-interviewer-investigators who can filter in these types of people, and statisticians can create models to predict people who are likely to be safe. A good proxy for this is to start by letting in women, elderly and children.<sup>9</sup> If Israel does create a Palestinian-friendly safety zone inside Israel, Egypt may go along and take a substantial amount of Gazan Palestinians temporarily into Sinai.

In a comment to a web article, a reader wrote that she suspected that the Netanyahu government may be planning to evict Palestinians to a concentration camp in the desert, and if they do, a lot of people in the region will be tinkering with low tech ways to send bombs to explode into Israel.<sup>10</sup> This would not happen because the Western allies would not accept this nor would the Arab population of Israel which

is 22% of the total, nor would the non-right-wing voters which in 2022 was 38% of the voter base.

If the model for these holding places are Nazi extermination camps, this should not and would not be allowed. However, if the model were to be the Japanese Internment Camps in the West Coast of the USA during WW2, it might be a better model, compared to the reality of living in Gaza during the Hamas War of today. As long as Gazan entry into these camps were voluntary, basic human rights were respected, families were kept together, food, medical care, and basic living infrastructure were provided, and it was monitored by the UN or friendly Arab neighboring countries, its quality of life would seem favorable compared to Gaza, even if a humanitarian ceasefire was to be in-effect.<sup>11</sup> As of December 25, 2023 nearly 1.37 million internally displaced persons (IDPs) were sheltering in 156 facilities operated by the United Nations Relief and Works Agency (UNRWA) across all five governorates of the Gaza Strip. At least 308 IDPs have been killed and 1,095 injured while sheltering in UNRWA premises from Oct. 7 to Dec. 25, 2023. 142 UNRWA workers have been killed.<sup>12</sup>

Not all Gazans will be able to enter this new safe zone. Along with this new safe zone, clean water, electricity, communications, and food imports should be brought into Gaza in much larger amounts. Bakeries should be repaired. Hospitals should be repaired, and auxiliary medical units should be created inside Gaza. Hospital ships should be brought to the port of Gaza. Internet connections should be established between medical personnel inside Gaza and doctors inside Israel and with doctors all over the world who want to help.

Egyptian President El-Sisi and The Atlantic Council has proposed something similar, but in the Negev Desert.<sup>13</sup> With hundreds of thousands of internally displaced Palestinians in Gaza, more than one area proximate to Gaza, may be required for temporary safe zones. The Negev can be another location to create safe zones.<sup>14</sup> The five-mile Gaza border extension would seem preferable because the military is already there and can help in the building of shelters and the provision of supplies; and can secure the area to prevent movement into Israel beyond the safe zone and to help maintain order inside the safe zones.

The implementation of new safe zones must be well monitored in such a way that there are ways to reverse the temporary Gazan movement into Israel if adverse effects get generated. This could also be an in vivo test for peaceful co-existence in a new two or three state solution.

## **Longer Term Strategy for Peace in Israel-Palestine -- Three State Solution**

The longer term strategy is a three state solution: a loose confederation of Theocratic Jewish Israel, Theocratic Moslem Palestine, and Liberal-Pluralistic Israel-Palestine, using the UN Universal Declaration of Human Rights as a constitutional framework.<sup>15</sup> Its 75th Anniversary was December 10.<sup>16</sup> “Theocratic here means a form of government in which one or more deities are recognized as supreme ruling authorities, giving divine guidance to human intermediaries who manage the government's daily affairs. ... The term was initially coined by Flavius Josephus in the first century AD to describe the government of the Jews. ... according to Josephus, the government of the Jews was unique. Josephus offered the term *theocracy* to describe this polity in which a god was sovereign, and the god's word was law.”<sup>17 18</sup>

However, Theocratic Jewish Israel and Theocratic Moslem Palestine, would not be pure theocracies because imposed on their sovereignty would be (1) the UN Universal Declaration of Human

Rights which would take precedence over laws generated from the Torah and the Quran; (2) a prohibition on laws and educational programs and materials that incite violence or promote antisemitism or islamophobia; and (3) laws and policies that provide the superstructure for the confederation such as: fiscal sharing, border permeability, and provision for a common defense against external enemies.<sup>19</sup> I expect each of three states to become city-states on the model of Singapore, with a union of three Singapores or one Singapore with three sectors. Each of the three states would borrow Singapore's Maintenance of Religious Harmony Act (MRHA) that defines the following as punishable offenses: urging force or violence on the basis of religion, or against a religious group or its members; inciting feelings of enmity, hatred, ill-will or hostility against a religious group; and insulting the religion or wounding the religious feelings of another person.<sup>20</sup> Sorry, no Don Rickles allowed. But, maybe in the future, there will be a maturing of feelings of brotherhood and sisterhood where comedic ethnic and religious insults can be allowed.

Even though Theocratic Jewish Israel would be a mostly Theocratic State, but not a pure Theocratic State, it would comport with the concept of Zionism: that Judaism is a nationality as well as a religion, and that Jews deserve their own state in their ancestral homeland.<sup>21</sup> It would be more Jewish in character, culture, and religion than the present State of Israel.

Noticeably absent, in this presentation about a Three State Solution, are definitions of borders, their degree of permeability, the extent of rights of return, and revenue sharing.<sup>22</sup> Those can be worked out in future negotiations.<sup>23</sup>

### **Security and De-Militarization**

Prime Minister Netanyahu articulated his prerequisites to peace in a recent Wall Street Journal OP-ED, They do not seem unreasonable but they should not imply a rejection of a (mostly) sovereign Palestinian State.<sup>24</sup> His three prerequisites are: "destroy Hamas, demilitarize Gaza, and deradicalize the whole of Palestinian society."<sup>25</sup> This makes sense as steps following a war initiated by a brutal massacre that generated a military response resulting in a high civilian death toll. It is similar to what the allied forces did in Japan and Germany after WW2. An unoccupied non-aggressive mostly-sovereign Palestinian state may require a few years to build. PM Netanyahu says, "Every territory we pull out from, we get terror, terrible terror against us." My response is: "Dear PM, don't just pull out: think of Maimonides and Tzedaka (Hebrew charity for self-sufficiency), think Marshall Plan, think W. Edwards Deming, think nation building, and think allyship."

To protect each state from aggressive action from the other states in the Confederation, states may only have local and state police forces for law enforcement. There would also be a state militia, similar to the state units of the National Guard in the USA, that serve under the command of their state governor for responding to natural disasters and other state emergencies.<sup>26</sup> In addition, there should be strong weapon control laws for civilians and law enforcement which permit only conventional non-automatic weapons. No bombs; no rockets; and no suicide vests. Only the Confederation, for purposes of national defense, can possess bombs, rockets, and missiles. To provide for an extra layer of defensive protection in the early years of this new Confederation, each state should be linked to an existing ally protector nation state. For example, the Theocratic Muslim State of Palestine, could be linked to Jordan or Egypt or Saudi Arabia. For the Theocratic Jewish State of Israel its protector nation can be the USA or Canada or Great Britain; and for the Liberal Pluralistic State of Israel-Palestine, it can be Norway or Germany or Finland.

## Separation and Integration

The two Theocratic States would satisfy sovereignty preferences in the sense that no amount of Moslem population growth and military acquisition would be allowed to dilute Jewish political power and cultural dominance in the Jewish Theocratic State; and no amount of Jewish population growth and military acquisition would be allowed to dilute Muslim power and cultural dominance in the Muslim Theocratic State. It would be permitted for Muslims to live in Theocratic Jewish Israel and for Jews to live in Theocratic Moslem Palestine, but the outsiders would not be able to vote in State elections.

An advantage of this new three state configuration is it would allow for strongly religion-focused Jews and Muslims to separate themselves from each other, while allowing members of these groups who desired to live in integrated and more secular settings to be able to do. I would imagine that minorities such as the Bahai, Druze, Samaritans, Black Hebrew Israelites, Atheists, Christians, Feminists, Domari, and LGBTQ as well as Reform Jews and Moderate Muslims would choose Liberal-Pluralistic Israel-Palestine.

Writers and scholars have claimed that it is impossible for Jews and Palestinians (Israelis + Gazans + West Bankers) to live in one nation with the same rights and still be a democratic Jewish state. In my three state solution with the one confederated union, it is possible for there to be a forever Jewish state (tolerated by Muslims), a semi- Jewish/semi-Muslim state, and a forever Muslim state (tolerated by Jews). People may discover that these tolerated states have more cross-cultural commonality and symbiosis than expected. I have visited the 19<sup>th</sup> Arrondissement neighborhood in Paris and found Jews and Muslims living harmoniously side by side.<sup>27</sup>

A three state confederation, as suggested here, would be more acceptable and more sustainable than the two-state solution as presently conceived in the Oslo Accords.<sup>28</sup> We could find this out in a poll or some quick focus groups.

From a skeptical comment by an Israeli named P\_ (on Nov. 21, 2023) to a web article about a binational confederation, I learned: "...a binational confederation at this point in history is a utopian mirage. ... Total separation – (seemingly insurmountable obstacles notwithstanding - except for absolute necessities) needs to be the most immediate goal once the military has completed its task in the war against Hamas. Then, later, when time has passed and both sides are more receptive to the idea of compromise, a gradual increase in interaction, but under the strictest security criteria, can and should be launched. ...The starting point is the destruction of violent extremism. The IDF is doing the job on Hamas et al. Israel must do the same with our violent fanatics now running amok on the West Bank.”<sup>29</sup>

I have done ethnographic research about religious groups and cults related to economics topics such as microenterprise development and the viability of intentional communities. Most of the religious groups I studied have had their own internal arrangement for creating, modifying, and monitoring the rules that structure their religious communities as micro theocracies. I visited the State of Utah, informally controlled by the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints, aka the Mormons, and the Crown Heights neighborhood of Brooklyn where the Chabad-Lubavitch Hasids, a Jewish ultra-religious group, dominate. I felt comfortable in both places though I would not want to move to either place because of the tight restrictions on the social behavior that is allowed.<sup>30 31</sup>

Scholars and activists have tried to specify configurations of Jews and Muslims sharing space in what is now Israel and the Palestine occupied territories. In this table below is a listing of eight of them, focusing on a Three State Solution or a Three-State-like Solution. I assert that my version of a Three State Solution allows the swiftest road to peace while also strongly fulfilling the nationalist desires of both Jews and Palestinians. There would be separation for some Jews and Palestinians and integration for others.

In the feedback received from readers of earlier drafts, it seemed there was a bit of confusion: Is this a (A) three state solution (Theocratic Jewish Israel, Theocratic Muslim Palestine, and Liberal Pluralistic Israel-Palestine) or (B) a four state solution (three states and one confederated union) or (C) a one state solution (one confederated union)? The answer is “Yes to all: (A), (B), and (C).” This form is sometimes called a Multi-National State. There are over 25 of these in the world today. The most famous is the United Kingdom (UK) made up of the four nations of England, Wales, Scotland, and Northern Ireland. But this example has a stronger central government body than would be the case, at least initially, in my Three State Confederation.

Who said nation building is simple? This is a start to the walk back from the trap of war. Over time, (A) (B) and (C) may change its ideologies and constitutions, and there may be mergers and changes of boundaries, but done through the rule of law.

An Israeli author wrote to me saying "I wish you success in suggesting anything new in an environment that keeps on repeating itself."

<b>Other Three State Solutions to Israel-Palestine</b>	<b>Author or Creator/ Date</b>	<b>Website</b>
Pre-Israel Palestine divided into districts with two national committees, Jewish and Arab, and a commonwealth federal executive and legislature.	IHUD (Unity) Party – Brit Shalom (1946)	<a href="https://www.encyclopedia.com/politics/dictionaries-thesauruses-pictures-and-press-releases/brit-shalom">https://www.encyclopedia.com/politics/dictionaries-thesauruses-pictures-and-press-releases/brit-shalom</a>
The Three-State Option: Jewish Israel, Gaza (cleansed from Hamas) merged into Egypt, West Bank merged into Jordan.	John R. Bolton (January 5, 2009)	<a href="https://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2009/01/04/AR2009010401434.html">https://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2009/01/04/AR2009010401434.html</a>
Jewish State of Israel, Palestinian State of Gaza, Palestinian State of West Bank	Noah Smith (Oct. 8, 2023)	<a href="https://www.noahpion.blog/p/a-three-state-solution-is-the-only">https://www.noahpion.blog/p/a-three-state-solution-is-the-only</a>
Jewish State of Israel, Hamas State of Palestine Gaza, Palestinian Authority State of Palestine West Bank	Martin A. Smith (Nov. 3, 2023)	<a href="https://www.e-ir.info/2023/11/03/last-exit-a-three-state-solution-to-the-israel-palestinian-dispute/">https://www.e-ir.info/2023/11/03/last-exit-a-three-state-solution-to-the-israel-palestinian-dispute/</a>

<p>Version 1: from United Nations-brokered cease-fire in 1949, Jewish Israel, and Palestinian territories of Gaza and West Bank to be administered by Egypt and Jordan.</p> <p>Version 2: Four state solution, also from 1949, same as above with Jerusalem as an independent city-state.</p> <p>Version 3: Jewish Israel, End the settlements in the West Bank and recognize both Gaza and the West Bank as two independent and sovereign nations.</p>	<p>Paul Poast (Nov. 3, 2023)</p>	<p><a href="https://www.worldpoliticsreview.com/israeli-palestinian-conflict-three-state-solution">https://www.worldpoliticsreview.com/israeli-palestinian-conflict-three-state-solution</a></p>
<p>Jewish Israel, Israel Occupied Gaza, Palestinian West Bank</p>	<p>Aaron Lnw (Nov. 2023)</p>	<p><a href="https://www.reddit.com/r/IsraelPalestine/comments/17mt7gw/the_three_state_solution/">https://www.reddit.com/r/IsraelPalestine/comments/17mt7gw/the_three_state_solution/</a></p>
<p>Jewish Israel, Palestinian Gaza, Binational West Bank called Judea-Palestine The later would be a sectarian democracy based on parity between the two communities.</p>	<p>Benjamin Kerstein (March 22, 2021)</p>	<p><a href="https://www.tabletmag.com/sections/israel-middle-east/articles/three-state-solution-benjamin-kerstein-peace-israel-palestine">https://www.tabletmag.com/sections/israel-middle-east/articles/three-state-solution-benjamin-kerstein-peace-israel-palestine</a></p>
<p>The author claims this is Netanyahu’s intention: Removal of Palestinians from East Jerusalem, Gaza, and West Bank and push them into Egypt, Jordan, and Lebanon, leaving only Jewish Israel “from the River to the Sea.”</p>	<p>Vijay Prashad (Nov. 2, 2023)</p>	<p><a href="https://www.peoplesworld.org/article/netanyahus-three-state-solution/">https://www.peoplesworld.org/article/netanyahus-three-state-solution/</a></p>

## ENDNOTES

---

<sup>1</sup> I want to thank friends and colleagues who read previous drafts and gave me critical feedback. I am especially thankful to the Chicago Political Economy Group (CPEG) who invited me to present a previous version of this paper at one of their recent meetings. I want to express appreciation to Professor Ron Baimon, who lived in Israel during the 1967 war, for sharing his views. As a Labor Zionist and radical economist, he holds a complex advocacy both for the survival of Israel and for Palestinian statehood. The views expressed in this paper are the author's and are not necessarily the opinions and beliefs of CPEG or its members.

<sup>2</sup> Hamas Official Ghazi Hamad: We Will Repeat The October 7 Attack, Time And Again, Until Israel Is Annihilated; We Are Victims – Everything We Do Is Justified (Oct. 24, 2023)

<https://www.memri.org/tv/hamas-official-ghazi-hamad-we-will-repeat-october-seven-until-israel-annihilated-victims-everything-we-do-justified>

<sup>3</sup> To understand the present Gazan War, it is helpful to see and hear the strong and scary rhetoric of Sinwar that helps push the Israelis to be so aggressive in their efforts to remove Hamas. Compilation of videos by Sinwar Yayha, 2017-2022. Second panel from the top. Mideast Media Research Institute (MEMRI). Most of this half hour video is captioned in English.

<https://www.memri.org/reports/hamas-leader-gaza-yahya-sinwar-israels-most-wanted-%E2%80%93-his-own-words-we-support-eradication>

<sup>4</sup> Two videos:

Ex-Hamas minister calls terror leader Sinwar ‘crazy,’ says Hamas destroyed Gaza, (Dec. 11, 2023) 8 minutes – All Israel News

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=iutgalhi2io>

Son of Hamas Co-Founder Denounces Group at UN, Exposes 'Savage' Indoctrination of Palestinian Kids (Nov. 21, 2023), 30 minutes

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=pjOeJumoABg>

<sup>5</sup> Sinwar is quoted as saying, “We would rather die as martyrs than die out of oppression and humiliation. We are ready to die, and tens of thousands will die with us.” in As Gaza Teeters on Precipice, a Hamas Leader Speaks Out (May 10, 2018).

<https://www.nytimes.com/2018/05/10/world/middleeast/gaza-protests-yehya-sinwar.html>

<sup>6</sup> Remarks of Secretary Antony J. Blinken at a Press Availability, The Okura, Tokyo, Japan, (November 8, 2023.)

<https://www.state.gov/secretary-antony-j-blinken-at-a-press-availability-41/>

<sup>7</sup> War Intensifies in Southern Gaza, Where Civilians Say No Place Is Safe

<https://www.nytimes.com/2023/12/05/world/middleeast/israel-hamas-gaza-khan-younis.html>

<sup>8</sup> People of Gaza ‘Being Told to Move Like Human Pinballs’, but Nowhere Is Safe, Secretary General Tells Security Council, Pleading for Humanitarian Ceasefire (Dec. 8, 2023)

<https://press.un.org/en/2023/sgsm22076.doc.htm>

<sup>9</sup> I am reminded of the Kindertransport project where, between 1938 and 1940, Jewish children were whisked into Great Britain to protect them from the violence in Germany and German occupied territories. KINDERTRANSPORT 1938–40, Holocaust Encyclopedia.

<https://encyclopedia.usmm.org/content/en/article/kindertransport-1938-40>

<sup>10</sup> In 1971 Israel built two detention camps in the Sinai Peninsula where Palestinians were sent. Abu Zenima was used for the families of Fatah members who were suspected of terrorism and Nekhel was for unemployed young men. After a Red Cross visit, the camps were closed later in 1971.

<https://www.haaretz.com/israel-news/2021-07-29/ty-article-magazine/.highlight/israel-secretly-detained-innocent-palestinians-in-desert-camps-in-1971/0000017f-e534-df5f-a17f-ffe499e0000>



Ktzi'ot Prison is an Israeli detention facility located in the Negev desert. During the First Intifada (Dec. 1987 to September 1993), Ktzi'ot was the location of the largest detention camp run by the Israeli army. It held three-quarters of all Palestinians held by the army, and over half of all Palestinians detained in Israel. According to Human Rights Watch, in 1990 it held approximately one out of every 50 West Bank and Gazan males older than 16.

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Ktzi%27ot\\_Prison](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Ktzi%27ot_Prison)

<sup>11</sup> Even after the war, Gazans will need a decent place to live while Gaza is reconstructed.

<sup>12</sup> UNRWA situation report #57 – On the situation in the Gaza strip and the West Bank including East Jerusalem. (December 28, 2023).

<https://www.unrwa.org/resources/reports/unrwa-situation-report-57-situation-gaza-strip-and-west-bank-including-east-jerusalem>

<sup>13</sup> Sisi rejects displacement of Palestinians into Sinai, suggests transfer to Israel's Negev desert: The Egyptian president's suggestion that Israel transfers Gazans to the Negev desert sparked different reactions in Egypt and the rest of the Arab world. (10/19/2023)

<https://theArabweekly.com/sisi-rejects-displacement-palestinians-sinai-suggests-transfer-israels-negev-desert>

A humanitarian corridor in the Israeli Negev could save Gazans (10/27/23)

<https://www.atlanticcouncil.org/blogs/menasource/humanitarian-corridor-israeli-negev-gaza-hamas/>

<sup>14</sup> A colleague at the presentation of my paper to a meeting of the Chicago Political Economy Group (CPEG) said he thought Northern Gaza could also become a safe zone. I think that would depend on how much of Hamas was already eliminated there, to keep civilians out of harm's way, and how easy it is to provide clean water there.

<sup>15</sup> Though different than the Three State Solution that I propose in this paper, the ideas of the Brit Shalom (Covenant of Peace) movement started in 1925 by Central European intellectuals have been inspiring. Members included Martin Buber (Existentialist Philosopher), Arthur Ruppin (Head of the Palestine Office of the World Zionist Organization), Judah Magnes (President of Hebrew University), and Gershon Sholem (a scholar of Jewish Mysticism). Albert Einstein was a supporter.

Brit Shalom: A Covenant of Peace: A little-known Zionist group that struggled for a peaceful solution to the Arab Question.

<https://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/brit-shalom-a-covenant-of-peace/>

<sup>16</sup> Peace, dignity, and equality on a healthy planet: Universal Declaration of Human Rights

<https://www.un.org/en/about-us/universal-declaration-of-human-rights>

Signatories include: Bahrain, Egypt, Indonesia, Islamic Republic of Iran, Iraq, **Israel**, Jordan,

Kuwait, Lebanon, Morocco, Oman, Qatar, Saudi Arabia, **State of Palestine**, Syrian Arab Republic,

Türkiye, United Arab Emirates, and Yemen.

<https://sdg.humanrights.dk/en/instrument/signees/24>

<sup>17</sup> Theocracy

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Theocracy>

<sup>18</sup> Flavius Josephus was a Jewish historian and military leader who was a follower of both Judaism and Roman rule.

<https://www.britannica.com/biography/Flavius-Josephus>

<sup>19</sup> To help the reader's imagination, I thought it useful to suggest some names for the Confederation Union. Here is my initial list: The Union of Israel, Palestine, and Israel-Palestine; The Confederated Union of Holy Land States; The Confederation of Levantine States; The Confederation of Eretz Yisroel, Dawlat Filastin, and Israel-Palestine. Take your pick or provide one of your own.

<sup>20</sup> Maintaining Racial and Religious Harmony.

<https://www.mha.gov.sg/what-we-do/managing-security-threats/maintaining-racial-and-religious->

[harmony](#)

<sup>21</sup> What is Zionism?

<https://www.vox.com/2018/11/20/18080010/zionism-israel-palestine>

<sup>22</sup> Each State could set their own laws regarding rights of return subject to common sense notions of preventing slums and urban overcrowding. The new vertical cities of the People's Republic of China could be models for this. Shabbat elevators or Shabbat Gentile helpers could be utilized in high rise buildings where Orthodox Jews live.

<sup>23</sup> However, upfront this land control would be sacrosanct: West Jerusalem including the Wailing Wall would be in Theocratic Jewish Israel; and East Jerusalem, including the Al Aqsa Mosque, would be in Theocratic Muslim Palestine.

<sup>24</sup> Netanyahu tells US he opposes creation of Palestinian state after Gaza war

PM rebuts White House by saying all territory west of Jordan River would be under Israeli security control (January 18, 2024)

<https://www.theguardian.com/world/2024/jan/18/netanyahu-tells-us-opposes-palestinian-state-after-gaza-war>

<sup>25</sup> Benjamin Netanyahu: Our Three Prerequisites for Peace: We must destroy Hamas, demilitarize Gaza and deradicalize the whole of Palestinian society. OP-ED By Benjamin Netanyahu (Dec. 25, 2023)

<https://www.wsj.com/articles/benjamin-netanyahu-our-three-prerequisites-for-peace-gaza-israel-bff895bd>

<sup>26</sup> ILLINOIS NATIONAL GUARD: PROTECT WHAT MATTERS MOST TO YOU!: Part-time Service; Lifelong Benefits.

<https://nationalguard.com/illinois>

<sup>27</sup> Jews and Muslims in the 19th arrondissement of Paris: face to face, or side by side? (July 4, 2023)

<https://www.mmh.mpg.de/1110388/blog-mayer-jews-and-muslims>

<sup>28</sup> After Oslo: rethinking the Two State Solution, A Brookings Policy Brief. (Oct. 2018)

[https://www.brookings.edu/wp-content/uploads/2018/06/fp\\_20180601\\_after\\_oslo.pdf](https://www.brookings.edu/wp-content/uploads/2018/06/fp_20180601_after_oslo.pdf)

<sup>29</sup> 'Separating Jews and Palestinians Cannot Work': Planning a Binational Confederation: 'We can't be a 'Villa in the Jungle,' we're part of a culture of Jewish-Arab connection that goes back many years,' says 'A Land For All' Executive Director Meron Rapoport, who selects five books about the concept of coexistence. (Oct. 3, 2023)

<https://www.haaretz.com/israel-news/2023-10-03/ty-article-magazine/.premium/separating-jews-and-palestinians-cannot-work-five-books-on-a-binational-confederation/0000018a-efe6-d3af-a3ce-efe604760000>

<sup>30</sup> I got gently and kindly kicked out of a wedding in Crown Heights for spending too much time watching the women dance.

<sup>31</sup> In the USA, when religious groups dominate an area, it usually gives that place a distinctive and congruent feel as opposed to being in a chain store strip mall anyplace-environment. I grew up in Detroit and loved spending time in the neighborhood-city of Hamtramck, dominated by Moslem Bangladeshis, Bosnians, and Yeminis; and in Dearborn, dominated by Arabs.

## References (not included in the endnotes)

-After the Reich: The Brutal History of the Allied Occupation  
by Giles MacDonogh, Basic Books, (2007).

-ALLMEP: Alliance for Mideast Peace: A Coalition of over 160 Non-Governmental Organizations

<https://www.allmep.org/>

-Brit Shalom

---

<https://www.encyclopedia.com/politics/dictionaries-thesauruses-pictures-and-press-releases/brit-shalom>

-Brit Shalom is considered the beginning of the peace movement in Israel. Its archive is kept in the CZA (Central Zionist Archives).

<http://www.zionistarchives.org.il/en/AttheCZA/AdditionalArticles/Pages/BritShalom.aspx>

-Devolution and Development: Territorial Justice and the North-South Divide in Publius, *The Journal of Federalism* (Winter, 2006).

<http://www.jstor.org/stable/20184949>

-An Israeli-Palestinian Confederation Is the Best Path to Peace: The plan would satisfy concerns across the political spectrum by tackling the thorniest issues in new ways. – *The Holy Land Confederation* (May 23, 2022).

<https://foreignpolicy.com/2022/05/23/israeli-palestinian-confederation-peace/>

-A Land For All: Two States, One Homeland: An Open Land for All: Israel-Palestine would be a singular territorial unit, with two states forming a confederation; each state would be sovereign and independent, but would be linked by an open border; Citizens will have equal rights in accordance with The Universal Declaration of Human Rights (2012).

<https://www.alandforall.org/english/?d=ltr>

-A Land of Two Peoples: Martin Buber on Jews and Arabs, Edited with commentary by Paul R. Mendes-Flohr, Oxford University Press. (1983).

-The Long Israeli-Palestinian Impasse: Is the ‘One-State Solution’ the Answer?

<https://www.norwich.edu/documents/journal-peace-war-studies-5th-edition> (Oct. 2023 - pp.: 19-35)

-The Movement That Imagined a Jewish Homeland Without the State of Israel Territorialism, and its opposition to mainstream Zionism, might help us unlock the breadth and depth of political imagination that came before the current impasse (Dec. 15, 2023).

<https://newlinesmag.com/essays/the-movement-that-imagined-a-jewish-homeland-without-the-state-of-israel/>

-Not Two States, Not One State: A New Way Out of Disaster for Israelis and Palestinians: One need only to look at Gaza to know what hard separation of Israel and Palestine can bring. Fortified fences, underground barriers – What if more openness and less separation is a better answer? It sounds mad, but there's a logic (Nov. 30, 2023).

<https://www.haaretz.com/israel-news/2023-11-30/ty-article/.premium/not-two-states-not-one-state-a-new-way-out-of-disaster-for-israelis-and-palestinians/0000018c-1fc0-d21c-abae-7ffc7f960000>

-Review of A land of two peoples: Martin Buber on Jews and Arabs (1983) Edited by Paul R. Mendes-Flohr in *International Affairs*, Volume 60, Issue 2, (Spring 1984), Page 341.

<https://academic.oup.com/ia/article-abstract/60/2/341/2406326>

-Territorial Justice in Israel/Palestine. *Theoretical Inquiries in Law*, (July 28, 2020).

<https://doi.org/10.1515/til-2020-0015>

---

-What Is Happening to Our World? (Dec. 29, 2023).

<https://www.nytimes.com/2023/12/29/opinion/israel-hamas-war.html>

-What is the two-state solution for Israel and Palestinians? (Dec. 14, 2023).

<https://news.sky.com/story/israel-hamas-war-what-is-the-two-state-solution-12985473>

-What is the “One-State Solution,” and Why is it Unlikely to Work?: SIS professor Guy Ziv answers questions about his new article on the history behind the idea of a “one-state solution” to solve the Israeli-Palestinian conflict. (Nov. 21, 2023).

<https://www.american.edu/sis/news/20231121-what-is-the-one-state-solution-and-why-is-it-unlikely-to-work.cfm>

**-00-**